OFFICIAL FILE LLINOIS COMMERCE COMMERCIANISSION



2004 FEB 11 A 11: 16

Illinois Commerce Commission) CIMER CLERK'S OFFICE
on its own motion) Docket No. 01-0705
Northern Illinois Gas Company d/b/a NICOR Gas Company))
Reconciliation of Revenues collected under Gas Adjustment Charges with Actual Costs prudently incurred)))
Illinois Commerce Commission on its own motion)))
) Docket No. 02-0067
Northern Illinois Gas Company d/b/a NICOR Gas Company)
Proceeding to review Rider 4, Gas Cost, pursuant to Section 9-244(c) of the Public Utilities Act)))
Illinois Commerce Commission on its own motion)))
) Docket No. 02-0725
Northern Illinois Gas Company d/b/a NICOR Gas Company))
Reconciliation of Revenues collected under Gas Adjustment Charges with Actual Costs prudently incurred)))) .

COOK COUNTY STATE'S ATTORNEY'S OFFICE EMERGENCY MOTION TO COMPEL DISCOVERY

The Cook County State's Attorney's Office ("CCSAO") hereby respectfully move the Administrative Law Judges ("ALJs") pursuant to Section 200.370 of the Commission's Rules of Practice to compel Northern Illinois Gas Company d/b/a Nicor Gas Company ("Nicor") to

completely and comprehensively answer CCSAO's second set of data requests. In support of said motion, CCSAO/CUB states as follows:

- CCSAO requests expedited ruling on this motion based on the imminent February 27
 due date for Intervenors' rebuttal testimony.
- 2. At issue in this Motion to Compel is CCSAO's second set of data requests sent to Nicor on December 17, 2003. This data request merely requested Nicor to produce provide all workpapers, reports, notes, memoranda, correspondence, computations and/or calculations that were used by any Nicor witness who submitted and/or submits testimony in this proceeding. (Exhibit A). CCSAO requested a response by December 24, 2003.
- On January 9, 2004, Nicor inappropriately responded to CCSAO's request with an
 objection. Nevertheless, Nicor responded by directing CCSAO to attachments to
 Nicor's direct testimony and documents Nicor had previously produced in discovery.
 (Exhibit B).
- 4. Since none of the documents referenced in Nicor's response failed to consist of any workpapers, handwritten notes summaries and emails, CCSAO discussed with Nicor the incompleteness of its response. This discussion occurred shortly before the status hearing on January 15, 2004.
- 5. On that same day, CCSAO sent an email to Nicor seeking cooperation from its experts to appropriately respond to CCSAO's second data request. CCSAO emphasized that CCSAO had disclosed 71 pages of handwritten notes. Moreover, CCSAO pointed out that it is against common sense to believe that Nicor's experts

- would not have any handwritten notes, summaries, emails or workpapers in a case of this magnitude. Nicor agreed to respond. (Exhibit C).
- On February 2, 2004, Nicor supplemented its response by providing various
 documents alleged to be workpapers of its witnesses Feingold and Moretti. No other
 Nicor witness produced any additional documentation. (Exhibit D).
- 7. On February 3, 2004, CCSAO contacted Nicor by email highlighting that Nicor's response was merely a production of documents by two of Nicor witnesses. Yet, Nicor presented five witnesses in its direct testimony and four in its rebuttal. In addition, Nicor only produced 34 pages of workpapers from Feingold and one page for witness Morretti. CCSAO again expressed that the produced documentation was incomplete. (Exhibit E). CCSAO also expressed that it would anticipate an expedited supplemental response in light of the February 27th deadline.
- 8. Later, on February 3, 2004, CCSAO received Nicor's second supplemental response which merely contained additional documents from Nicor's witness Feingold.

 (Exhibit F).
- 9. On February 6, 2004, CCSAO for its fourth time, expressed disappointment and frustration that the documentation produced was insufficient. (Exhibit G) In addition, CCSAO still had not received any documents from any other witnesses. Since Nicor had since December to respond, CCSAO requested to know by February 9, 2004 whether discovery is complete.

- 10. Later that same day, on February 6, 2004 Nicor sent its third supplemental response. (Exhibit H) At the conclusion of the response Nicor noted as it had in each of the previous responses "Nicor Gas reserves the opportunity to supplement this response as appropriate." Nicor Gas Company Response to Cook County State's Attorney's Office Second Data Request, 3rd Supp., February 6, 2004. With the next round of testimony due by CCSAO and CUB's witness on February 27, 2004 the time is past for waiting for any other supplemental responses from Nicor.
- 11. CCSAO has consulted with attorneys from Nicor and reasonable attempts to resolve differences has failed. 83 Ill. Admin. Code Section 200.350. CCSAO notified Nicor regarding discovery concerns in e-mails dated January 15, 2004, February 3, 2004 and on February 6, 2004.
- 12. The Commissions rules provide "It is the policy of the Commission to obtain full disclosure of all relevant and material facts to a proceeding..." 83 Ill. Admin. Code 200.340. CCSAO believes that common sense leads one to conclude that there are additional materials available that are responsive to its data request. Nicor should be compelled to provide the additional materials immediately or provide a reasonable explanation for their absence.

Wherefore, CCSAO and CUB respectfully request the ALJ compel Nicor to provide a complete and comprehensive response to CCSAO's Second Set of Data Requests to Nicor without further delay. To the extent that Nicor believes that any of the responsive documents are privileged that they be produced instanter to the ALJ's for an in camera examination and ruling on the alleged privilege. Further, we request an expedited schedule on this motion to compel.

Respectfully,

RICHARD A. DEVINE

COOK COUNTY STATE'S ATTORNEY

Mark N. Pera

Assistant State's Attorney

Supervisor, Environment & Energy Division 69 W Washington Suite 700 Chicago, Illinois 60602

312-603-8632

mpera@cookcountygov.com

STATE OF ILLINOIS)	
)	SS
COUNTY OF COOK)		

<u>VERIFICATION</u>

NOW COMES MARK N. PERA, who, after first being sworn, deposes and says:

- 1. That he is an Assistant State's Attorney in Cook County assigned to represent the People of Cook County in any proceedings in connection with the attached Cook County State's Attorney's Office Emergency Motion To Compel Discovery; and
- 2. That he has read the attached Cook County State's Attorney's Office and the Emergency Motion To Compel Discovery that the facts alleged therein are true and correct to the best of his knowledge and belief.

MARK N. PERA

Man U Ren

SUBSCRIBED AND **SWORN** to before me this 10th day

of February, 2004.

Notary Public

Official Seal
Latonia McGahee
Notary Public State of Illinois
My Commission Expires 11/30/07

STATE OF ILLINOIS

ILLINOIS COMMERCE COMMISSION

Illinois Commerce Commission)
on its own motion)
Northern Illinois Gas Company d/b/a NICOR Gas Company) Docket No. 01-0705)
Reconciliation of Revenues collected under Gas Adjustment Charges with Actual Costs prudently incurred))))
Illinois Commerce Commission on its own motion)) Docket No. 02-0067
Northern Illinois Gas Company d/b/a NICOR Gas Company)
Proceeding to review Rider 4, Gas Cost, pursuant to Section 9-244(c) of the Public Utilities Act)))
Illinois Commerce Commission on its own motion))) Docket No. 02-0725
Northern Illinois Gas Company d/b/a NICOR Gas Company)
Reconciliation of Revenues collected under Gas Adjustment Charges with Actual Costs prudently incurred)))

NOTICE OF FILING

TO: See Attached Service List

PLEASE TAKE NOTICE that on this date February 10, 2004, we have filed by sending by Federal Express today to the Chief Clerk of the Illinois Commerce Commission the enclosed Cook County State's Attorney's Office Emergency Motion To Compel Discovery in the above-captioned docket.

RICHARD A. DEVINE

State's Attorney of Cook County

By: Mar When

Mark N. Pera

Assistant State's Attorney

Environment & Energy Division

Cook County State's Attorney's Office

69 W. Washington Street, Suite 700

Chicago, IL 60602

Telephone: (312) 603-8600

Fax: (312) 345-2217

E-mail: mpera@cookcountygov.com

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, MARK N. PERA, hereby certify that a copy of the enclosed Cook County State's Attorney's Office Emergency Motion To Compel Discovery were served on all parties on the attached list on the 10th day of February 2004 by hand delivery, or Federal Express, or electronic mail, or U.S. first class mail prepaid.

Mark N. Pera

Assistant State's Attorney

SERVICE LIST

ICC DOCKET NO. 02-0067

Thomas A. Andreoli
Atty. for Northern Illinois Gas Company
d/b/a Nicor Gas Company
Sonnenschein Nath & Rosenthal
8000 Sears Tower
233 S. Wacker Drive
Chicago, IL 60606
tandreoli@sonnenschein.com

Richard C. Balough Atty. for Citizens Utility Board Richard C. Balough, Attorney-at-Law 656 W. Randolph Street, Suite 500 West Chicago, IL 60661 rbalough@balough.com

Margaret Barnabee
Chairman's Assistant
Illinois Commerce Commission
160 N. LaSalle Street, Suite C-800
Chicago, IL 60601-3104
mbarnabe@icc.state.il.us

Janice A. Dale
Assistant Attorney General
Public Utilities Bureau
100 W. Randolph Street, 11th Floor
Chicago, IL 60601
jdale@atg.state.il.us

James A. Davidson
United States Securities & Exchange
Commission
175 West Jackson St., Suite 900
Chicago, IL 60604
davidsonj@sec.gov

Leijuana Doss
Assistant State's Attorney
Cook County State's Attorney's Office
Environment and Energy Division
28 N. Clark Street, Suite 300
Chicago, IL 60602
Idoss@cookcountygov.com

Glennon P. Dolan
Administrative Law Judge
Illinois Commerce Commission
160 N. LaSalle Street, Suite C-800
Chicago, IL 60601
gdolan@icc.state.il.us

Mary Everson
Case Manager
Illinois Commerce Commission
527 E. Capitol Avenue
Springfield, IL 62701
meverson@icc.state.il.us

Asheesh Goel
United States Securities & Exchange
Commission
175 W. Jackson Street, Suite 900
Chicago, IL 60604
goela@sec.gov

George N. Gilkerson, Jr. Rooks Pitts 4200 Commerce Court Lisle, Illinois 60532 ggilkerson@rookspitts.com

SERVICE LIST

ICC DOCKET NO. 02-0067

Paul Gracey
Vice President & General Counsel
Nicor Gas Company
1844 W. Ferry Road
Naperville, IL 60563
pgracey@nicor.com

Michael Guerra
Atty. for Northern Illinois Gas Company
d/b/a Nicor Gas Company
Sonnenschein Nath & Rosenthal
8000 Sears Tower
Chicago, IL 60606
mguerra@sonnenschein.com

Albert E. Harms
Manager Rate Research
Northern Illinois Gas Company
1844 W. Ferry Road
P.O. Box 190
Aurora, IL 60507-0190
aharms@nicor.com

Leslie D. Haynes
Administrative Law Judge
Illinois Commerce Commission
160 N. LaSalle Street, Suite C-800
Chicago, IL 60601
Ihaynes@icc.state.il.us

Mark G. Kaminski
Assistant Attorney General
Public Utilities Bureau
100 W. Randolph Street, 11th Floor
Chicago, IL 60601
mkaminski@atg.state.il.us

Robert Kelter
Citizens Utility Board
208 S LaSalle St., Ste. 1760
Chicago, IL 60604
rkelter@citizensutilityboard.org

Steve Knepler
Case Manager
Illinois Commerce Commission
527 E. Capitol Avenue
Springfield, IL 62701
sknepler@icc.state.il.us

Mark Maple
Case Staff
Illinois Commerce Commission
527 E. Capitol Avenue
Springfield, IL 62701
mmaple@icc.state.il.us

Hugh R. McCombs
Atty. for Northern Illinois Gas Company
d/b/a Nicor Gas Company
Mayer, Brown, Rowe & Maw LLP
190 S. LaSalle Street
Chicago, IL 60603-3441
hmccombs@mayerbrownrowe.com

Daniel McNamara
Nicor Gas Company
1844 West Ferry Road
Naperville, IL 60563
dmcnamara@nicor.com

Jerome Mierzwa
Exeter Associates
5565 Sterrett Place, Suite 310
Columbia, MD 21044
imierzwa@exeterassociates.com

SERVICE LIST

ICC DOCKET NO. 02-0067

Sarah Naumer Atty. for Northern Illinois Gas Company Sonnenschein Nath & Rosenthal 233 South Wacker Drive Chicago, IL 60606 snaumer@sonnenschein.com

Karin Norington-Reaves Citizens Utility Board Suite 1760 208 S. LaSalle Street Chicago, IL 60604 knorington@cuboard.org

Angela O'Brien
Atty. for Northern Illinois Gas Company
Mayer, Brown, Rowe & Maw
190 S. LaSalle Street
Chicago, IL 60603
aobrien@mayerbrownrowe.com

Mark N. Pera
Assistant State's Attorney
Cook County State's Attorney's Office
Environment and Energy Division
28 N. Clark Street, Suite 300
Chicago, IL 60602
mpera@cookcountygov.com

John J. Reichart
Office of General Counsel
Illinois Commerce Commission
160 N LaSalle St., Ste. C-800
Chicago, IL 60601
jreichar@icc.state.il.us

Elizabeth A. Rolando Chief Clerk Illinois Commerce Commission 527 East Capitol Avenue Springfield, IL 62701 erolando@icc.state.il.us

John E. Rooney
Atty. for Northern Illinois Gas Company
d/b/a Nicor Gas Company
Sonnenschein Nath & Rosenthal
8000 Sears Tower
Chicago, IL 60606
jrooney@sonnenschein.com

Marie Spicuzza
Assistant State's Attorney
Cook County State's Attorney's Office
Environment and Energy Division
28 N. Clark Street, Suite 300
Chicago, IL 60602
mspicuz@cookcountygov.com

Russ Strobel
Northern Illinois Gas Company
d/b/a Nicor Gas Company
1844 W Ferry Rd
Naperville, IL 60563
rstrobe@nicor.com

Janis Von Qualen
Office of General Counsel
Illinois Commerce Commission
527 E Capitol Ave.
Springfield, IL 62701
jvonqual@icc.state.il.us